



Everybody
has an
Opinion



Guenter's Thoughts



1. **Stock:** Citizens of both countries are not necessarily of the same stock. The Muslims (at least the upper class of them) were mostly of Persian stock. Their most successful converts were from the lower castes of India, sick of the caste system. Indians have Dravidian roots, along with many other tribal contributions.
2. **Military:** Both are nuclear powers. India has more resources than Pakistan.
3. **Strategic:** Has the Khyber Pass no strategic value to the West anymore as it once had it for the British Raj? It cuts through the Spin Ghar mountains instead of through the Hindu Kush thus offering a comparatively easy route between the valley of Kabul and the plains of Punjab).
4. **Religion:** Hinduism was (before recently) the more tolerant religion. There are many variations of this faith, most of whom were left alone. Hindu Nationalism is the new threat to their democracy. They are replicating the Muslim nationalism of Pakistan. Sunnis are the majority in Pakistan.
5. **Class System:** Islam does not have a caste system officially. But in India, Indian Muslims have a tacit caste system, as also in Pakistan.
6. **Potential:** Neither India nor Pakistan has the discipline of the Chinese or Koreans. Islam is one of the problems. Hinduism is the other problem. Religious fanaticism is more important to both than economic astuteness.

Guenter's Thoughts

7. Trade: (trade is always politics)

- India is the 17 th largest export economy in the world.
- Top exports: US, United Arab Emirates, China, Hong Kong and Germany.
- Top import: China, USA, United Arab Emirates, Switzerland and Saudi Arabia.

- Pakistan is the 68 th largest export economy in the world.
- Top exports: USA, Germany, China, UK and Afghanistan.
- Top Imports: China, United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia, Indonesia and Japan.

8. Outlook:

- India is missing some of the basic building blocks of modern society:
Popular buy-in, government legitimacy, sufficient food or energy or markets.
Central authority will remain fairly strong, even as most everything else about the country weakens.
- Pakistan similar situation but it is a state under siege, perhaps even a failed state.
- In both countries corruption on all levels of society as of Jan 2020.



Guenter's Thoughts



9. Geographic:

-The Indus River (1976 miles long) and the Ganges River (1578 miles) originate at almost the same region in Tibet, an autonomous region of China, yet their deltas are on opposite sides, i.e. Indus in Pakistan, Ganges mostly through India ending in Bangladesh.

-The Indus valley is the Pakistani heartland. However, unlike the Ganges, the middle sections of the Indus system receive no rainfall. Therefore irrigation is key to human survival (like the Nile valley) causing navigation only 100 miles inland from the Indian Ocean to Hyderabad. From a social point of view, this puts Pakistan in a similar situation like Egypt. A very thin crust of society manages the extremely capital poor system and everyone else is a de facto slave.

- India's geographic risk is that China can severely reduce or even cut off completely Ganges fertile water basin which is some 300 miles wide leading into the most densely populated region of the world.

Guenter's Thoughts



10. Youth Bulge:

- As per Gunnar Heinsohn, societies with 30% or more youth population between age 0 - 15 years have been global risks for stability. The dynamic of "youth bulge" does not come from lack of food but, as they get older, from the scarcity of job positions, status, opportunities, influence and respect.
- Islamic terror correlates highly with youth bulges in Islamic States or in societies with large Muslim minorities.

- Here is a ranking of Nations with children ending age 14 in the year of 2003:

1 India with 345 out of 1050 million or 33%

4 Pakistan with 60 out of 148 million or 41%.

- Estimates of the Population Reference Bureau indicate that India and Pakistan will remain within the top 15 "Children Nations" among the top 15 largest Nation Populations by 2050:

1 India with 1,628 million

4 Pakistan with 332 million.

11. Education:

- India has increased the literacy rate up to 74% by May 2019, which was 12% at the time of independence i.e. 1947.
- Pakistan vows to increase the literacy rate from 58% to 70% in 4 years as of Jan 2020.

Discussion Questions India and Pakistan

- Two Sovereign Nations have Nuclear capability: Why is this not a priority discussion for the world's nations...an if you were a mediator what proposal would you consider placing on the agenda for a potential solution?
- What should India do for the rising tide of population and increasing demand by young folks for a better life?
- What problem confronts the US in its relationship with Pakistan? What solutions might be proposed to bridge the gap between the two nations?
- Can the UN play a more constructive role in bringing feuding parties to the negotiating table than it has in the past? What are your proposals?
- Is it in the best interest of the US to keep strong relations with Prime Minister (*book has it as President, that is incorrect*) Modi, despite the controversy surrounding his administrations recent actions?
- Do you agree that some blame must be laid at the feet of the Trump administration fir not having ambassadors for either India or Pakistan? How can the US restore trust and a good working relationship with both countries

